



November 7th, 2023

Orlando Cruz, P.E.
San Antonio Water System
2800 U.S. Highway 281 North
San Antonio, Texas 78212

Re: Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades Project
Solicitation No. CO-00687
SAWS Job No. 21-8601
Bid Evaluation and Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Cruz,

A total of six bids were received on October 18, 2023, for Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades Project. SAWS Contracting performed verification of the bids and discovered a mathematical error with the submittal from Pesado Construction Co, Inc., who then decided to withdraw their bid. Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. (Kimley-Horn) evaluated the bid package provided by the lowest apparent bidder Shannon-Monk, Inc. (Shannon-Monk), with a total bid of \$5,767,448.00. The bids for this project are summarized below.

Bidder	Total Bid Amount
<i>Engineer's OPCC</i>	\$5,000,000.00
Shannon-Monk, Inc.	\$5,767,448.00
Payton Construction Inc.	\$5,856,495.68
<i>Bidder's Average</i>	\$6,559,794.12
Associated Construction Partners, Ltd.	\$6,906,509.00
Archer Western Construction, LLC	\$7,036,737.92
Integrated Water Services, Inc.	\$7,231,780.00

Bid Pricing Evaluation

The total bid submitted by Shannon-Monk, Inc. was \$5,767,448.00, approximately 15% higher than the Engineer's estimate of \$5,000,000.00 with allowances included.

Kimley-Horn compared the bid prices to the Engineer's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost (OPCC) for each individual item included in the Bid Proposal.

Bid Item No.	Description	Bid Total Amount	Engineer's Estimate	Total Difference	% Difference
1	Tank Improvements	\$190,000.00	\$240,000	\$50,000.00	-21%
2	Site Improvements	\$792,000.00	\$990,000	\$198,000.00	-20%
3	Pump Station Improvements	\$1,200,000.00	\$1,130,000	\$70,000.00	6%
4	Electrical Improvements	\$2,110,000.00	\$1,188,000	\$922,000.00	78%
5	Instrumentation, Controls, And Security Improvements	\$440,000.00	\$359,000	\$81,000.00	23%

Bid Item No.	Description	Bid Total Amount	Engineer's Estimate	Total Difference	% Difference
6	SCADA Improvements	\$300,000.00	\$530,000	\$230,000.00	-43%
7	Remove Concrete Curb	\$1,474.00	\$3,015	\$1,541.00	-51%
8	Tack Coat (CoSA Spec)	\$380.00	\$1,140	\$760.00	-67%
9	Hot Mix Asphalt Pavement, Type B (10-Inch Comp. Depth)	\$19,110.00	\$15,435	\$3,675.00	24%
10	Hot Mix Asphalt Pavement, Type C (2-Inch Comp. Depth)	\$21,960.00	\$7,320	\$14,640.00	200%
11	Flowable Fill (Low Strength)	\$16,000.00	\$11,840	\$4,160.00	35%
12	Concrete Curb	\$4,690.00	\$4,355	\$335.00	8%
13	Topsoil (4-Inch Depth)	\$5,550.00	\$4,440	\$1,110.00	25%
14	Hydromulching	\$1,660.00	\$1,660	\$0.00	0%
15	Trench Excavation Safety Protection	\$14,940.00	\$4,980	\$9,960.00	200%
16	8-Inch PVC Gravity Sanitary Sewer Pipe (ASTM D-3034) (SDR-26) (All Depths)	\$124,500.00	\$59,760	\$64,740.00	108%
17	4 Foot Diameter Sanitary Sewer Manhole (0-6 Foot Depth)	\$48,000.00	\$32,000	\$16,000.00	50%
18	Concrete Encasement, Cradles, Saddles, And Collars	\$4,500.00	\$19,800	\$15,300.00	-77%
19	Post-Construction Sanitary Sewer Main Television Inspection (8-Inch To 15-Inch)	\$3,984.00	\$9,960	\$5,976.00	-60%
20	Permitting Allowance	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	\$0.00	0%
21	CPS Energy Allowance	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	\$0.00	0%
22	Additional Site Area Improvements Allowance	\$5,000.00	\$5,000	\$0.00	0%
23	Cathodic Protection Allowance	\$40,000.00	\$40,000	\$0.00	0%
24	Mobilization And Demobilization, Max 7% Of Subtotal Line Items 1 - 19	\$365,000.00	\$323,000	\$42,000.00	13%
25	Preparing Right-Of-Way, Max 4% Of Subtotal Line Items 7 - 19	\$10,000.00	\$8,000	\$2,000.00	25%
26	Intermediate Mobilization/Re-Mobilization	\$8,700.00	\$15,000	\$6,300.00	-42%
TOTAL:		\$5,767,448.00	\$5,000,000	\$767,448.00	15%

- **Bid Item 1, Tank Improvements** – The glass-fused bolted-steel tank specified has a limited pool of contractors with the necessary qualifications to perform the required tank improvements. Recognizing this, Kimley-Horn included a premium for this work that appears to be more conservative than the cost submitted.
- **Bid Item 2, Site Improvements** – Kimley-Horn anticipated added costs due to the site having a somewhat tight footprint surrounded by a busy commercial area. This may be the difference versus the actual amount submitted by the contractor.
- **Bid Item 3, Pump Station Improvements** – In this case, Kimley-Horn may have underestimated the labor cost of start-up and sequencing, particularly in relation to the switching over to the new pump station from the old system.
- **Bid Item 4, Electrical Improvements** – There is a limited pool of electrical contractors and there continue to be significant price fluctuations for items under this scope of work. These considerations were factored into the projected cost prepared by Kimley-Horn, but apparently not sufficiently.
- **Bid Item 6, SCADA Improvements** – In this case, Kimley-Horn assumed higher costs to account for the limited pool of electrical contractors and significant price fluctuations previously mentioned. These costs were somewhat overestimated.
- **Bid Item 16, 8-Inch PVC Gravity Sanitary Sewer Pipe (ASTM D-3034) (SDR-26) (All Depths)** – Kimley-Horn included a premium on the projected cost for the installation of the 300 feet of sewer due to the relatively small quantity of pipeline. However, it appears that this premium was not high enough in comparison to the costs submitted by Shannon-Monk. It may be that Shannon-Monk put more of a premium on these costs due to the work restrictions that are required by the landowner for work within their parking lot. Additionally, Shannon-Monk, Inc. may have included a cost markup for utilizing a subcontractor for this sewer installation.
- **Bid Item 26, Intermediate Mobilization/Re-Mobilization** – Kimley-Horn priced this item more conservatively, but due to other local ongoing work, this may be a lesser expense for Shannon-Monk, Inc. than projected.

Bidder's Relevant Experience and Reference Responses

Kimley-Horn contacted and evaluated Shannon-Monk, Inc.'s previous experiences with related projects and their relevant qualifications provided in the Statement of Bidder's Experience. We offer the following as a summary of the reference evaluations of their qualifications:

1. San Antonio, TX – Southwest Research Institute - Ordinance Well Booster Pump Station

Project Summary: Construction of a new 380,000 gallon ground storage tank, new pump building, yard piping, two flow meter assemblies, sodium hypochlorite feed system, intruder resistant fence, power distribution, and control and standby electric generator.

Reference Name, Reference Title: William Hayes – Facilities Director

Q: Any change orders on the project? If so, were they contractor driven or owner driven?

A: Yes, there were 6 change orders that were owner driven.

Q: Was the project completed on time and within budget?

A: It was completed on time and within budget. There were slowdowns for lead times due to COVID, but it was finished on schedule despite these issues.

Q: Were they cooperative and easy to work with to address issues that arose?

A: Yes.

Q: Were there any significant issues/problems?

A: No. Not to recollection.

Q: If given the opportunity, would you hire this contractor again in the future?

A: Yes, the contractor was especially helpful as an advocate to the owner.

2. San Antonio, TX – SAWS - Culebra Pump Station Project

Project Summary: Installation of new submersible well pumps, 0.75 MG GST, three new high service pumps, piping, electrical, and controls at existing SAWS Culebra Pump Station.

Reference Name, Reference Title: Carlos Fermaintt – Manager of Construction

Q: Any change orders on the project? If so, were they contractor driven or owner driven?

A: Yes, there were change orders that were owner driven. There were 8 change orders: 6 owner requested, 1 due to errors and omissions, and 1 recapitulation.

Q: Was the project completed on time and within budget?

A: Yes, based on the information obtained from archived files, it is not clear why project final completion was on 8/09/13. It was completed within budget.

Q: Were they cooperative and easy to work with to address issues that arose?

A: Yes.

Q: Were there any significant issues/problems?

A: No. Not to recollection.

Q: If given the opportunity, would you hire this contractor again in the future?

A: Yes, the project met expectations and met overall satisfaction, but it was over 10 years ago.

3. City of Kenedy, TX – Wastewater Treatment Plant Phase II Improvements

Project Summary: Improvements to existing aeration basin, aerobic digester, and chemical storage area. Project included construction with vertical steel, utility and concrete work, and coordination with electrical and SCADA subcontractors.

Reference Name, Reference Title: Mark Garcia – City Engineer

Q: Any change orders on the project? If so, were they contractor driven or owner driven?

A: No.

Q: Was the project completed on time and within budget?

A: Yes

Q: Were they cooperative and easy to work with to address issues that arose?

A: No.

Q: Were there any significant issues/problems?

A: No.

Q: If given the opportunity, would you hire this contractor again in the future?

A: Yes.

Kimley-Horn reviewed Shannon-Monk's project experience, and verified references provided. The Contractor's reference projects reflect similar pump station and facilities work. Responses were received from three references and these responses were favorable.

Shannon-Monk's bid is deemed responsive, and references reflect that they are qualified to execute this work. Kimley-Horn recommends that Shannon-Monk be awarded the construction contract for the low bid submission of \$5,767,448.00, including the allowances, for the Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades Project.

Sincerely,

Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.



V. Ryan Sowa, P.E.
Project Manager

Enclosures:

Attachment A – Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades Project Bid Tabulation

Attachment A

Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades Project Bid Tabulation



San Antonio Water System Solicitation Vendor Price List

Run Date 10/18/2023

Prepared By : Janie M. Powell

Solicitation No : CO-00687

Job # : 21-8601

Contract No :

SAN ANTONIO WATER SYSTEM
PO Box :2994
San Antonio, Texas, 78298-2449
TABULATION OF BIDS

Proposal : Brooks Recycled Water Pump Station Upgrades

Time And Date : October 18, 2023 at 11:00 AM (CDT)

Price List

Line No	Item No	Quote Category	SOV Item	Item Description	Unit	CO-00687 - 1_PESADO CONSTRUCTION CO INC			CO-00687 - 2_ARCHER WESTERN CONT LTD.			CO-00687 - 3_PAYTON CONSTRUCTION INC			CO-00687 - 4_SHANNON MONK INC			CO-00687 - 5_ASSOCIATED CONSTRUCTION			CO-00687 - 6_Integrated Water Services, Inc.		
						Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount	Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount	Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount	Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount	Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount	Unit Price	Qty	Total Amount
1	01270	General Water Bid Items		TANK IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$250,000.00	1	\$250,000.00	\$231,900.00	1	\$231,900.00	\$190,000.00	1	\$190,000.00	\$190,000.00	1	\$190,000.00	\$200,000.00	1	\$200,000.00	\$542,000.00	1	\$542,000.00
2	01270	General Water Bid Items		SITE IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$500,000.00	1	\$500,000.00	\$850,500.00	1	\$850,500.00	\$380,000.00	1	\$380,000.00	\$792,000.00	1	\$792,000.00	\$350,000.00	1	\$350,000.00	\$785,000.00	1	\$785,000.00
3	01270	General Water Bid Items		PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$1,600,000.00	1	\$1,600,000.00	\$1,760,800.00	1	\$1,760,800.00	\$1,425,000.00	1	\$1,425,000.00	\$1,200,000.00	1	\$1,200,000.00	\$3,561,000.00	1	\$3,561,000.00	\$1,977,000.00	1	\$1,977,000.00
4	01270	General Water Bid Items		ELECTRICAL IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$1,625,000.00	1	\$1,625,000.00	\$2,751,100.00	1	\$2,751,100.00	\$2,560,000.00	1	\$2,560,000.00	\$2,110,000.00	1	\$2,110,000.00	\$1,400,000.00	1	\$1,400,000.00	\$2,185,000.00	1	\$2,185,000.00
5	01270	General Water Bid Items		INSTRUMENTATION, CONTROLS, AND SECURITY IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$415,000.00	1	\$415,000.00	\$455,000.00	1	\$455,000.00	\$546,000.00	1	\$546,000.00	\$440,000.00	1	\$440,000.00	\$370,000.00	1	\$370,000.00	\$524,000.00	1	\$524,000.00
6	01270	General Water Bid Items		SCADA IMPROVEMENTS	LS	\$290,000.00	1	\$290,000.00	\$355,900.00	1	\$355,900.00	\$397,000.00	1	\$397,000.00	\$300,000.00	1	\$300,000.00	\$259,000.00	1	\$259,000.00	\$367,000.00	1	\$367,000.00
7	103.1	General Water Bid Items		REMOVE CONCRETE CURB	LF	\$20.00	67	\$1,340.00	\$33.00	67	\$2,211.00	\$56.00	67	\$3,752.00	\$22.00	67	\$1,474.00	\$12.00	67	\$804.00	\$10.00	67	\$670.00
8	203.1	General Water Bid Items		TACK COAT (COSA SPEC)	GAL	\$19.00	19	\$361.00	\$135.00	19	\$2,565.00	\$28.00	19	\$532.00	\$20.00	19	\$380.00	\$50.00	19	\$950.00	\$10.00	19	\$190.00
9	205.2	General Water Bid Items		HOT MIX ASPHALT PAVEMENT, TYPE B (10-INCH COMP. DEPTH)	SY	\$115.00	147	\$16,905.00	\$258.00	147	\$37,926.00	\$164.00	147	\$24,108.00	\$130.00	147	\$19,110.00	\$50.00	147	\$7,350.00	\$100.00	147	\$14,700.00
10	205.3	General Water Bid Items		HOT MIX ASPHALT PAVEMENT, TYPE C (2-INCH COMP. DEPTH)	SY	\$90.00	183	\$16,470.00	\$75.00	183	\$13,725.00	\$49.00	183	\$8,967.00	\$120.00	183	\$21,960.00	\$180.00	183	\$32,940.00	\$120.00	183	\$21,960.00
11	413.2	General Water Bid Items		FLOWABLE FILL (LOW STRENGTH)	CY	\$420.00	32	\$13,440.00	\$257.50	32	\$8,240.00	\$233.00	32	\$7,456.00	\$500.00	32	\$16,000.00	\$500.00	32	\$16,000.00	\$210.00	32	\$6,720.00
12	500.1	General Water Bid Items		CONCRETE CURB	LF	\$30.00	67	\$2,010.00	\$91.00	67	\$6,097.00	\$128.00	67	\$8,576.00	\$70.00	67	\$4,690.00	\$15.00	67	\$1,005.00	\$40.00	67	\$2,680.00
13	515.1	General Water Bid Items		TOPSOIL (4-INCH DEPTH)	CY	\$55.00	111	\$6,105.00	\$24.00	111	\$2,664.00	\$63.00	111	\$6,993.00	\$50.00	111	\$5,550.00	\$50.00	111	\$5,550.00	\$200.00	111	\$22,200.00
14	520.1	General Water Bid Items		HYDROMULCHING	SY	\$25.00	332	\$8,300.00	\$43.00	332	\$14,276.00	\$3.00	332	\$996.00	\$5.00	332	\$1,660.00	\$5.00	332	\$1,660.00	\$5.00	332	\$1,660.00
15	550	General Water Bid Items		TRENCH EXCAVATION SAFETY PROTECTION	LF	\$2.00	498	\$996.00	\$10.04	498	\$4,999.92	\$54.00	498	\$26,892.00	\$30.00	498	\$14,940.00	\$15.00	498	\$7,470.00	\$10.00	498	\$4,980.00
16	848	General Water Bid Items		8-INCH PVC GRAVITY SANITARY SEWER PIPE (ASTM D-3034) (SDR-26) (ALL DEPTHS)	LF	\$150.00	498	\$74,700.00	\$78.00	498	\$38,844.00	\$124.00	498	\$61,752.00	\$250.00	498	\$124,500.00	\$175.00	498	\$87,150.00	\$225.00	498	\$112,050.00
17	852	General Water Bid Items		4 FOOT DIAMETER SANITARY SEWER MANHOLE (0-6 FOOT DEPTH)	EA	\$10,400.00	2	\$20,800.00	\$8,100.00	2	\$16,200.00	\$19,233.00	2	\$38,466.00	\$24,000.00	2	\$48,000.00	\$15,000.00	2	\$30,000.00	\$27,000.00	2	\$54,000.00
18	858	General Water Bid Items		CONCRETE ENCASEMENT, CRADLES, SADDLES, AND COLLARS	CY	\$700.00	9	\$6,300.00	\$590.00	9	\$5,310.00	\$624.00	9	\$5,616.00	\$500.00	9	\$4,500.00	\$350.00	9	\$3,150.00	\$1,500.00	9	\$13,500.00
19	866	General Water Bid Items		POST-CONSTRUCTION SANITARY SEWER MAIN TELEVISION INSPECTION (8-INCH TO 15-INCH)	LF	\$6.00	498	\$2,988.00	\$10.00	498	\$4,980.00	\$7.00	498	\$3,486.00	\$8.00	498	\$3,984.00	\$10.00	498	\$4,980.00	\$15.00	498	\$7,470.00
20	01270	General Water Bid Items		PERMITTING ALLOWANCE	ALW	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00
21	01270	General Water Bid Items		CPS ENERGY ALLOWANCE	ALW	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	1	\$20,000.00
22	01270	General Water Bid Items		ADDITIONAL SITE AREA IMPROVEMENTS ALLOWANCE	ALW	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00
23	01270	General Water Bid Items		CATHODIC PROTECTION ALLOWANCE	ALW	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	1	\$40,000.00
24	100	General Water Bid Items		MOBILIZATION AND DEMOBILIZATION, MAX 7% OF SUBTOTAL LINE ITEMS 1 - 19	LS	\$300,000.00	1	\$300,000.00	\$380,000.00	1	\$380,000.00	\$50,000.00	1	\$50,000.00	\$365,000.00	1	\$365,000.00	\$425,000.00	1	\$425,000.00	\$464,000.00	1	\$464,000.00
25	101	General Water Bid Items		PREPARING RIGHT-OF-WAY, MAX 4% OF SUBTOTAL LINE ITEMS 7 - 19	LS	\$6,814.92	1	\$6,814.92	\$3,500.00	1	\$3,500.00	\$7,903.68	1	\$7,903.68	\$10,000.00	1	\$10,000.00	\$7,500.00	1	\$7,500.00	\$10,000.00	1	\$10,000.00
26	102	General Water Bid Items		INTERMEDIATE MOBILIZATION/RE-MOBILIZATION	EA	\$30,000.00	1	\$30,000.00	\$5,000.00	1	\$5,000.00	\$18,000.00	1	\$18,000.00	\$8,700.00	1	\$8,700.00	\$50,000.00	1	\$50,000.00	\$30,000.00	1	\$30,000.00
Total								\$5,272,187.92			\$7,036,737.92			\$5,856,495.68			\$5,767,448.00			\$6,906,509.00			\$7,231,780.00
Calendar Days To Complete : 660																							

WITHDRAWN